



MILITARY LAW REVIEW

ARTICLES

CAUTIOUS SKEPTICISM ABOUT THE BENEFIT OF ADDING MORE FORMALITIES
TO THE *MANUAL FOR COURTS-MARTIAL* RULE-MAKING PROCESS:
A RESPONSE TO CAPTAIN KEVIN J. BARRY

Captain Gregory E. Maggs

A REPLY TO CAPTAIN GREGORY E. MAGGS'S "CAUTIOUS SKEPTICISM"
REGARDING RECOMMENDATIONS TO MODERNIZE THE *MANUAL FOR COURTS-*
MARTIAL RULE-MAKING PROCESS

Kevin J. Barry

THE EXHAUSTION COMPONENT OF THE *MINDES* JUSTICIABILITY TEST
IS NOT LAID TO REST BY *DARBY V. CISNEROS*

Captain E. Roy Hawkens

THE THIRTEENTH WALDEMAR A. SOLF LECTURE IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

Professor Yoram Dinstein

THE CONCEPT OF BELLIGERENCY IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

Lieutenant Colonel Yair M. Lootsteen

CASE NOTES

BOOK REVIEWS

MILITARY LAW REVIEW

Volume 166

December 2000

CONTENTS

ARTICLES

- Cautious Skepticism About the Benefit of Adding More Formalities
to the *Manual for Courts-Martial* Rule-Making Process:
A Response to Captain Kevin J. Barry
Captain Gregory E. Maggs 1
- A Reply to Captain Gregory E. Maggs's "Cautious Skepticism"
Regarding Recommendations to Modernize the *Manual for Courts-
Martial* Rule-Making Process
Kevin J. Barry 37
- The Exhaustion Component of the *Mindes* Justiciability Test
Is Not Laid to Rest by *Darby v. Cisneros*
Captain E. Roy Hawkens 67
- The Thirteenth Waldemar A. Solf Lecture in International Law
Professor Yoram Dinstein 93
- The Concept of Belligerency in International Law
Lieutenant Colonel Yair M. Lootsteen 109

CASE NOTES

- Review of Recent Decisions of the *Ad Hoc* International
War Crimes Tribunals
Major Geoffrey S. Corn 142
- The Fine Line Between Policy and Custom: *Prosecutor v. Tadic*
and Customary International Law of Internal Armed Conflict
Major Ian G. Corey 145
- Duress as a Defense to War Crimes and Crimes Against Humanity—
Prosecutor v. Drazen Erdemovic
Major Stephen C. Newman 158
- Prosecutor v. Zejnil Delalic* (The Celebici Case)
Jennifer M. Rockoff 172

BOOK REVIEWS

- Black Hawk Down*
Reviewed by *Major Tyler J. Harder* 199
- Embracing Defeat: Japan in the Wake of World War II*
Reviewed by *Colonel Fred L. Borch III* 206
- Lincoln's Men: How President Lincoln Became a Father to an Army*
Reviewed by *Major Mary J. Bradley* 211
- On Killing*
Reviewed by *Major Robert Bowers* 219
- Rattling the Cage: Toward Legal Rights for Animals*
Reviewed by *Lieutenant Commander R. A. Conrad* 226
- Son Thang: An American War Crime*
Reviewed by *Major David D. Velloney* 234

Headquarters, Department of the Army, Washington, D.C.

Pamphlet No. 27-100-166, December 2000

MILITARY LAW REVIEW—VOLUME 166

Since 1958, the *Military Law Review* has been published at The Judge Advocate General's School, United States Army, Charlottesville, Virginia. The *Military Law Review* provides a forum for those interested in military law to share the products of their experience and research, and it is designed for use by military attorneys in connection with their official duties. Writings offered for publication should be of direct concern and import to military legal scholarship. Preference will be given to those writings having lasting value as reference material for the military lawyer. The *Military Law Review* encourages frank discussion of relevant legislative, administrative, and judicial developments.

EDITORIAL STAFF

CAPTAIN TODD S. MILLIARD, *Senior Editor*

MAJOR MARY J. BRADLEY, *Editor*

MR. CHARLES J. STRONG, *Technical Editor*

The *Military Law Review* (ISSN 0026-4040) is published quarterly by The Judge Advocate General's School, 600 Massie Road, Charlottesville, Virginia 22903-1781, for use by military attorneys in connection with their official duties for \$17 each (domestic) and \$21.25 (foreign) per year (see Individual Paid Subscriptions to the *Military Law Review* on pages vi and vii). Periodicals postage paid at Charlottesville, Virginia and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *Military Law Review*, The Judge Advocate General's School, United States Army, Charlottesville, Virginia 22903-1781.

SUBSCRIPTIONS: Private subscriptions may be purchased from the Superintendent of Documents, United States Government Printing Office, Washington, D.C. 20402; you may call (202) 512-1800. See the subscription form and instructions at the end of this section. Publication exchange subscriptions are available to law schools and other organizations that publish legal periodicals. Editors or publishers of these periodicals should address inquiries to the Editor of the *Military Law Review*. Inquiries and address changes concerning subscriptions for Army legal offices, ARNG and USAR JAGC officers, and other federal agencies should be addressed

to the Editor of the *Military Law Review*. Judge advocates of other military services should request distribution from their publication channels.

CITATION: This issue of the *Military Law Review* may be cited as 166 MIL. L. REV. (page number) (2000). Each issue is a complete, separately numbered volume.

INDEXING:

- * The primary *Military Law Review* indices are volume 81 (summer 1978) and volume 91 (winter 1981).
- * Volume 81 included all writings in volumes 1 through 80, and replaced all previous *Military Law Review* indices.
- * Volume 91 included writings in volumes 75 through 90 (excluding Volume 81), and replaces the volume indices in volumes 82 through 90.
- * Volume 96 contains a cumulative index for volumes 92-96.
- * Volume 101 contains a cumulative index for volumes 97-101.
- * Volume 111 contains a cumulative index for volumes 102-111.
- * Volume 121 contains a cumulative index for volumes 112-121.
- * Volume 131 contains a cumulative index for volumes 122-131.
- * Volume 141 contains a cumulative index for volumes 132-141.
- * Volume 151 contains a cumulative index for volumes 142-151.
- * Volume 161 contains a cumulative index for volumes 152-161.

Military Law Review articles are also indexed in *A Bibliography of Contents: Political Science and Government; Legal Contents (C.C.L.P.); Index to Legal Periodicals; Monthly Catalogue of United States Government Publications; Index to United States Government Periodicals; Legal Resources Index*; three computerized databases—the *Public Affairs Information Service, The Social Science Citation Index*, and *LEXIS*—and other indexing services. Issues of the *Military Law Review* are reproduced on

microfiche in *Current United States Government Periodicals on Microfiche* by Infodata International Inc., Suite 4602, 175 East Delaware Place, Chicago, Illinois 60611. The *Military Law Review* is available at <http://www.jagcnet.army.mil> beginning with Volumes 165 through 154.

SUBMISSION OF WRITINGS: Articles, comments, recent development notes, and book reviews should be submitted in Microsoft Word, to the Editor, *Military Law Review* at Todd.Milliard@hqda.army.mil. If electronic mail is not available, please forward the submission in duplicate, double-spaced to the Editor, *Military Law Review*, The Judge Advocate General's School, United States Army, Charlottesville, Virginia 22903-1781. Authors also should submit electronic copies on 3 1/2 inch computer diskettes, preferably in Microsoft Word format.

Footnotes should be typed double-spaced, and numbered consecutively from the beginning to the end of a writing, not chapter by chapter. Citations should conform to *The Bluebook, A Uniform System of Citation* (17th ed. 2000), copyrighted by the *Columbia, Harvard, and University of Pennsylvania Law Reviews* and the *Yale Law Journal*, and to *Military Citation* (TJAGSA 6th ed. 1997). Masculine pronouns appearing in the text will refer to both genders unless the context indicates another use.

Typescripts should include biographical data concerning the author or authors. This data should consist of branch of service, duty title, present and prior positions or duty assignments, all degrees (with names of granting schools and years received), and previous publications. If the article was a speech or was prepared in partial fulfillment of degree requirements, the author should include date and place of delivery of the speech or the source of the degree.

EDITORIAL REVIEW: The Editorial Board of the *Military Law Review* consists of the Deputy Commandant of The Judge Advocate General's School; the Director of Legal Research and Communications Department; and the Editor of the *Military Law Review*. Professors at the School assist the Editorial Board in the review process. The Editorial Board submits its recommendations to the Commandant, The Judge Advocate General's School, who has final approval authority for writings published in the *Military Law Review*. The *Military Law Review* does not purport to promulgate Department of the Army policy or to be in any sense directory. The opinions and conclusions reflected in each writing are those of the author

and do not necessarily reflect the views of The Judge Advocate General or any governmental agency.

The Editorial Board will evaluate all material submitted for publication. In determining whether to publish an article, note, or book review, the Editorial Board will consider the item's substantive accuracy, comprehensiveness, organization, clarity, timeliness, originality, and value to the military legal community. No minimum or maximum length requirement exists.

When a writing is accepted for publication, the Editor of the *Military Law Review* will provide a copy of the edited manuscript to the author for prepublication approval. Minor alterations may be made in subsequent stages of the publication process without the approval of the author.

Reprints of published writings are not available. Authors receive complimentary copies of the issues in which their writings appear. Additional copies usually are available in limited quantities. Authors may request additional copies from the Editor of the *Military Law Review*.

BACK ISSUES: Copies of recent back issues are available to Army legal offices in limited quantities from the Editor of the *Military Law Review*. Bound copies are not available and subscribers should make their own arrangements for binding if desired.

REPRINT PERMISSION: Contact the Editor, *Military Law Review*, The Judge Advocate General's School, United States Army, Charlottesville, Virginia 22903-1781.

Individual Paid Subscriptions to the *Military Law Review*

The Government Printing Office offers a paid subscription service to the *Military Law Review*. To receive an annual individual paid subscription (4 issues), complete and return the order form on the next page.

RENEWALS OF PAID SUBSCRIPTIONS: You can determine when your subscription will expire by looking at your mailing label. Check the number that follows "ISSDUE" on the top line of the mailing label as shown in this example:

When this digit is 3, a renewal notice will be sent.

MILR SMITH212J ISSDUE00 <u>3</u> R1 JOHN SMITH 212 MAIN ST FORESTVILLE MD
--

The numbers following ISSDUE indicate how many issues remain in the subscription. For example, ISSDUE001 indicates a subscriber will receive one more issue. When the number reads ISSDUE000, you have received your last issue unless you renew.

To avoid a lapse in your subscription, promptly return the renewal notice with payment to the Superintendent of Documents. If your subscription service is discontinued, simply send your mailing label from any issue to the Superintendent of Documents with the proper remittance and your subscription will be reinstated.

INQUIRIES AND CHANGE OF ADDRESS INFORMATION: The individual paid subscription service is handled solely by the Superintendent of Documents, not the Editor of the *Military Law Review* in Charlottesville, Virginia.

For inquires and change of address for individual paid subscriptions, fax your mailing label and new address to (202) 512-2250 or send your mailing label and new address to the following address:

United States Government Printing Office
Superintendent of Documents
ATTN: Chief, Mail List Branch
Mail Stop: SSOM
Washington, D.C. 20402

